MONTEREY COUNTY PLANNING COMMISSION

Meeting: August 8, 2007. Time 9:00 PM	Agenda Item No.:1				
Project Description: A Combined Development Permit cons	sisting of: 1) Administrative Permit and				
Design Approval for the construction of a new 5,138 square	foot, two story single family dwelling				
with an attached 1,080 square foot, three-car garage, and a	a 600-square-foot attached guesthouse,				
retaining wall; 287-foot long driveway; and grading; (approx					
yards of fill) located in a "S" zoning district; 2) Use Permit	to allow development on slopes greater				
than 30-percent,; and 3) Use Permit for the removal of 23 prote	ected trees (Coast live oak).				
Project Location : 5435 Quail Meadows Drive, Carmel	APN: 157-171-054-000				
Highlands					
Planning Number: PLN060468	Name: Anthony Jaurique				
Plan Area: Carmel Valley Master Plan	Flagged and Staked: No				
Zoning Designation:					
"LDR/B-6-D-S" or [Low Density Residential, Building Site D	sistrict and Design Control District and				
Site Plan Review Zoning District Overlays].					
CEQA Action: Categorically Exempt per section 15303(a)					

RECOMMENDATION:

Department: RMA-Planning Department

Staff recommends that the Planning Commission approve the Combined Development Permit based on the Findings and Evidence (Exhibit C) and subject to the recommended Conditions (Exhibit D).

PROJECT OVERVIEW:

Anthony Jaurique owns a 3.9-acre parcel within the Quail Meadows Subdivision This property is zoned Low Density Residential, Building Site District, Design District, and Site Plan Review Overlays ("LDR/B-6-D-S") and is restricted to development within a recorded building envelope. Area outside of the building envelope includes a scenic conservation easement that is restricted from development of structures.

The applicant requests entitlements to construct a new single family dwelling, attached 3-car garage, and attached guesthouse. As designed, the project would include development on 30% slopes to develop a driveway and removal of 23 Coast live oak trees within the building envelope:

- Slopes; The entire east side of the property fronts onto Quail Meadows Drive and is encumbered by slopes of 30%. Alternatives considered to avoid slopes would require additional tree removal and altering existing scenic easements. Therefore, staff determined that there are no feasible alternatives that would avoid development on slopes greater than 30-percent.
- Trees; A Forest Management Plan (FMP) prepared for the project determined that the removal of 23 oak trees would not significantly affect the remaining oak woodlands due to the health of the trees and the limited number of trees impacted. Staff requested that the Forester assess the possibility of transplanting some of the removed trees to a new location on-site. An addendum to the FMP indicates that all 23 trees should be replaced because the current condition of the trees would not ensure their long-term survival. The report also suggests that replanting the new, healthy trees would better serve the existing old growth to appropriately fill in the canopy as well as insure the continuation of the oak woodland.

Staff finds that the project as proposed meets the County's General Plan and the Carmel Valley Master Plan policies for:

- Preservation of natural resources
- Regulations under Title 21 of the Monterey County Zoning Ordinance governing development within an "S" zoning district (Section 21.145.010)

- Development on slopes in excess of 30-percent (Section 21.64.230) and,
- Requirements set forth under the approved Quail Meadows subdivision.
- Proposed tree removal is the minimum amount of tree removal required for the project.

Staff consider that tree removal within the building envelope was evaluated as part of the EIR for the Quail Meadows subdivision and that the project is below the threshold of significances for conversion of Oak woodlands and there are no unusual circumstances. As such, the project may be categorically exempted from CEQA review and conditions of approval are suitable for the proposed project.

DISCUSSION: See (Exhibit B)

OTHER AGENCY INVOLVEMENT:

- ✓ Planning Department
- ✓ Camel Highlands Fire Protection District
- ✓ Public Works Department
- ✓ Parks Department
- ✓ Environmental Health Division
- ✓ Water Resources Agency

All the above checked agencies, Divisions and departments have reviewed this project. Carmel Highlands Fire Protection District, Public Works, Parks Department, Environmental Health Division, Water Resources Agency have provided conditions of approval (**Exhibit D**).

Initially this project was not referred to the Carmel Valleys Land Use Advisory Committee for review because it began as an administrative permit; however, due to project revisions (development on 30% slopes) the project was appropriately referred to the LUAC for comment at their meeting on August 2, 2007. Results of this hearing and a copy of the minutes will be reported verbally to the Planning Commission.

Note: The project is appealable to the Board of Supervisors.

Ramon A. Montano, Assistant Planner

(831) 755-5169 montanor@co.monterey.ca.us

cc: Planning Commission Members (10); Carmel Highlands Fire Protection District; Public Works Department; Environmental Health Division; Water Resources Agency; Carl Holm, Planning Services Manager; Ramon A. Montano, Planner; Carol Allen, Anthony and Alison Jaurique, Applicants; Lombardo & Gilles, Agent; Planning File PLN060468.

ow the development to occur
ement access to Lot 54

PROJECT DATA SHEET

EXHIBIT B PROJECT DISCUSSION PLN060468 (Jaurique)

I. PROJECT SETTING AND DESCRIPTION:

Setting

The project site is approximately 3.9 acres located within the Quail Meadows Subdivision on Quail Meadows Road in the Carmel Valley Master Plan Area. The property is currently undeveloped and is zoned for low-density residential use. Topographically the site slopes down from Quail Meadows Road (west to east) dropping from the 99-foot elevation at the proposed driveway entrance off Quail Meadows Road to the 80-foot elevation the lowest point of the proposed development. The area within the building envelope where the residence is proposed to be constructed is relatively flat with little or no ground vegetation in the footprint of the proposed structure and driveway. The development would remove 23 Coast Live Oaks, which is approximately 6.29 percent of the total estimated tree count for the subject property (approximately 365 oak trees). The parcel is surrounded by mostly residential communities set within areas considered as Oak Woodlands by the certified Quail Meadows Environmental Impact Report (EIR). The building envelope represents the maximum building site area after consideration of county requirements for setback, 30-percent slope, tree protection, and public viewshed. No structures shall be allowed on any portion of the lot unless within the "building envelope". The northeast corner of the property is narrow and is restricted by a scenic conservation easement to protect the slopes and heavy vegetation.

Project Description

The project consists of constructing a new 5,138 square foot, two-story single family dwelling with an attached 1,080 square foot, three-car garage, and a 600-square-foot attached guesthouse, retaining wall, and grading; (approx. 620 cubic yards of cut and 880 cubic yards of fill). Access to the site will include a 237-foot long driveway off Quail Meadows Road. In addition to the driveway, the plans include a guest parking area for one vehicle located at the southwest corner of the residence. Two additional uncovered parking areas located along the driveway south-east of the main entrance to the residence. This area was required as a condition of approval by the Fire Protection District to be utilized as a turn-around. Development of the driveway occurs on slopes of 30-percent in the area fronting Quail Meadows Drive between the residence and the road. The project as proposed will require removal of 23 Monterey Coast Live Oak trees ranging in size between 15- and 24-inches.

II. ANALYSIS

Development Standards

The site is designated for low density residential "LDR/B-6-D-S" or Low density Residential, Building Site District, Design District, and Site Plan Review Overlays The orientation of the proposed residence finds the structure completely within the building envelope. The front entrance of the structure is facing south and the garage is located at the east end of the residence. The west end of the structure where the gust house is located faces the actual front of the property which is parallel to Quail Meadows Drive Table 1 shows how development standards for height, lot coverage, and setback requirements are met. The B-6 restricts the property from any further subdivision but imposes the set back requirements as listed under B-4. Additionally Design approval is required and under the "S" designation the construction of a residence must be considered through an Administrative Permit to consider the affect of the development to the natural resources and site constraints of the property. The proposed residence is sited within the building envelope; therefore no further issues remain with the residence.

TABLE 1; Development Standards

STANDARD	REQUIRED	PROPOSED
Height	25' feet	24'.9"
Front Set Back	30 feet	50'
Side Set Backs	10% lot width (max 20 feet)	45'. 9" & 130'
Rear Set Back	20 feet	Greater than 20;
Lot Coverage	25%	

Therefore, no unresolved issues remain under the county development standards.

Development on slopes in excess of 30-percent

The project proposes a 287-foot-long driveway to provide the residence access to the main road (Quail Meadows Drive). The first 50 feet of the driveway will traverse an area located on slopes of 30-percent. Additionally, the northeast corner of the property is restricted by a scenic conservation easement thereby eliminating possible access to Ranch San Carlos Road. Staff analyzed alternate locations for the driveway however the driveway as proposed will create the least amount of impact to the site, specifically with regard to tree removal. Therefore, per Section 21.64.230.of Title 21 the finding require that it be determined that no feasible alternatives would allow the development to occur on slopes less 30-percent. Therefore, based on the evidence and analysis of the site, staff finds no reasonably feasible alternatives which would allow the driveway to be developed entirely on slopes less 30-percent and that the proposed development better achieves the protection of natural resources per the goals, and policies and objectives of the Monterey County General Plan and applicable area plan than other development alternatives

The applicant in a memo submitted written justification for the proposed driveway design dated January 18, 2007 (Exhibit E). The applicant states that access was originally allowed through the adjacent property. However the adjacent property owner previously owned Lot 53 and the subject Lot 54. When Lot 54 was sold, the seller revoked the access easement. Across his property (Lot 53) leaving Lot 54 the project site without access to Quail Meadows Drive. For that reason the subject property is limited to the portion of the property fronting Quail Meadows Drive.

Tree Removal

The proposed project includes an application for a use permit to remove 23 Coast live oak trees. Removal of more than three protected native trees requires a Use Permit (Section 21.64.260.3 Zoning Code). Section 21.64.260 of the Zoning Code requires that a Forest Management Plan be prepared to catalog the trees, determine the condition of the forest, and make recommendations for the replanting and overall safeguard of the health of the existing forest. A Forest Management Plan (FMP), prepared by Matt Horowitz, was submitted on November 21, 2006 and was revised to determine the condition of the trees to be removed and average tree count per acre (92.86 trees per acre) for a total of 365.86 trees on the subject property. The existing oak woodland habitat is estimated to cover over 90% of the (3.94 acres). Additionally the Forester determined that the 23 trees proposed for removal constitutes approximately 6.29% of the existing Oak Woodland habitat.

Staff has worked with the applicant to explore alternatives that may better meet the intent of the policies in the Monterey County General Plan and the Carmel Valley Master Plan (CVMP Policy 7.2.2.5 (CV),) and also recognizing the current requirements under Senate Bill 1334 to identify significant impacts from the conversion of oak woodlands. In addition, staff considered analysis and mitigation measures completed with the approved Quail Meadows Subdivision and worked with the applicant, in keeping with their proposed design, to reduce removal of healthy, mature Oak trees to the minimum required under the circumstances.

Staff finds that significant development anywhere on the lot would require the removal of protected trees. Development is restricted to the building envelope and the number of trees indicated in the project description is the minimum required to be removed for the proposed residence. The structure is completely located within the building envelope and will require the removal of 6.29 percent of the existing oak woodland. The property will retain 93.71 percent of the oak woodland habitat. The project meets the intent of the CVMP Policy to discourage the removal of healthy, native oaks, and to maintain the maximum feasible degree of the natural character of the forest. The Forest Management Plan states that building anywhere on the site will necessitate the removal of some protected trees, and that it makes more sense to retain the healthiest landmark oaks whenever possible to maintain the overall heath of the forest.

For that reason staff requested that the Forester assess the possibility of transplanting some of the removed trees to a new location on-site. Due to the health of the trees, the Forester determined that all of the 23 trees proposed for removal should be replaced and that the current condition of the trees would not ensure their long-term survival. The report suggests that replanting with new healthy trees would better serve the existing old growth to appropriately fill in the canopy as well as insure the continuation of the oak woodland habitat. Recommendations contained in the report have been made conditions of approval to protect the trees not proposed for removal (Condition #7) and to require replanting on a one to one basis for each Coast Live Oak tree (18 inches or greater dbh) to be replaced with 24 inch box trees and for trees (17 inches or less) 15 gallon trees shall be used as replacements as required under (Condition #8).

CEQA

The project entails development of a single family home and a guest unit on an existing legal lot of record created through the Quail Meadows subdivision in 1971. Section 15303(a) of the California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) exempts the construction of single-family residences and accessory structures. The project consists of a single-family home with an attached guest unit on 3.9 acres in a residential neighborhood. The Quail Meadows Subdivision recorded building envelopes with conservation easements located outside those envelopes.

An EIR for this subdivision evaluated potential impacts and mitigated for development within the building envelopes. The project is not located within the public viewshed, however the project will require development on slopes in excess of 30-percent and will require the removal of 23 protested trees. The project is part of a residential neighborhood, slope issues are addressed in the Geotechnical report prepared for the project, and no healthy landmark trees are proposed for removal. Staff finds that the proposed project is within the scope evaluated in the Quail Meadows Subdivision EIR and mitigated as part of that project.

Staff reviewed technical reports prepared for the proposed project and visited the site to assess if there were any unique conditions that may supersede this exemption. The amount of oak trees being removed has been minimized (23 total) and equates to about 6.29% of the total number of trees on the site (365). Senate Bill 1334 requires the County to determine whether a project within its jurisdiction may result in the conversion of oak woodlands that will have a significant effect on the environment the overall intent of which is to preserve and manage the Oak Woodland habitat resources within the state. Subsequently the County after consultation with the California Department of Fish and Game (DFG) determined that an impact of 10-percent or more to oak woodland may be considered the threshold for a significant impact. Based on the Forest Management Plan, the total area of oak woodland affected by the proposed development (6.29%) is less than the established 10-percent threshold; and therefore, is not subject to SB 1334 and does not warrant further environmental review.

Staff concludes that there are no unique circumstances and no unresolved issues remain.

EXHIBIT C FINDINGS AND EVIDENCE

1. **FINDING: CONSISTENCY** – The project, as described in Condition No. 1 and as conditioned, conforms to the policies, requirements, and standards of the Monterey County General Plan, Carmel Valley Master Plan, Greater Monterey Area Plan Inventory and Analysis, and the Monterey County Zoning Ordinance (Title 21), which designates this area as appropriate for development.

EVIDENCE: (a) The text, policies, and regulations in the above referenced documents have been evaluated during the course of review of applications. No conflicts were found to exist. No communications were received during the course of review of the project indicating any inconsistencies with the text, policies, and regulations in these documents.

- (b) The property is located at 5435 Quail Meadows Drive (Assessor's Parcel Number 157-171-054-0000), west of Carmel Valley Road in the Carmel Valley Master Plan Area. The parcel is zoned Low Density Residential, Building Site Zoning and Design Control District and Site Plan Review Zoning District Overlays ("LDR/B-6-D-S"). The subject property complies with all the rules and regulations pertaining to zoning uses and any other applicable provisions of Title 21, and is therefore suitable for the proposed development.
- (c) The project planner conducted a site inspection in January of 2007, to verify that the project on the subject parcel conforms to the plans listed above.
- (d) This application is for a new single-family home, attached garage, and attached guesthouse. The subject property is zoned for residential uses; however, the property maintains a Site Plan Review zoning district overlay ("S"). The proposed residence conforms to the site development standards under Title 21 Section 21.145.010. Staff determined that the project as designed would not adversely affect the natural resources on site or surrounding area within the subdivision. Additionally the project will require a use permit to overcome site constraints with regard to slope. If approved the use permit will not impose undue restrictions on the property.
- (e) The removal of 23 Coast Live Oaks is allowed with the approval of a Use Permit in accordance with Section 21.64.260 of Monterey County Code (Title 21). The proposed residence is located within the established building envelope approved under the Quail Meadows subdivision. The potential for tree removal was analyzed in the certified Environmental Impact Report, which recognized that tree removal would be required for the development of some lots. The development was designed in a manner to minimize the amount of tree removal within the established building envelope (see Finding 3).
- (f) The project as proposed will require the development of a driveway on slopes in excess of 30-percent (30%). Based on the circumstances of the project the county finds (per Section 21.64.230.of Title 21) no feasible alternatives which would allow development to occur on slopes of less than 30%. Additionally the development as proposed would better achieve the goals, policies, and objectives of the Monterey County General Plan policies relating to the conservation and preservation of natural resources and Carmel Valley Master Plan (CVMP) 7.2.2.5 (CV). (Finding 3).
- (g) Initially this project was not referred to the Carmel Valley Land Use Advisory Committee for review because it began as an administrative permit;

however, due to project revisions (development on 30-percent slopes) the project was appropriately referred to the LUAC for comment at their meeting on August 2, 2007. [NOTE: Actions, recommendations, and comments will be provided to the Planning Commission as errata at the August 8, 2007 meeting].

- (h) The application, project plans, and related support materials submitted by the project applicant to the Monterey County RMA Planning Department for the proposed development found in Project File PLN060468.
- 2. **FINDING SITE SUITABILITY -** The site is physically suitable for the use proposed.
 - **EVIDENCE:** (a) The project has been reviewed for site suitability by the following departments and agencies: RMA Planning Department, Carmel Highlands Fire Protection District, Public Works, Parks Department, Environmental Health Division, and Water Resources Agency. There has been no indication from these departments/agencies that the site is not suitable for the proposed development. Conditions recommended have been incorporated.
 - (b) Technical reports by outside geological and forester consultants indicated that there are no physical or environmental constraints that would indicate the site is not suitable for the proposed use. County staff concurs. The following reports have been prepared:
 - "Forest Management Plan" (LIB070057) prepared by Forest City Consulting, Carmel, CA, November 21, 2006.
 - "Amended Forest Management Plan prepared by
 - Forest City Consulting, Carmel, CA, May 3, 2007.
 - "Amended Forest Management Plan" (Final report) prepared by Forest City Consulting, Carmel, CA, July 2, 2007.
 - "Soil Engineering Investigation" (LIB070055) prepared by Lanset Engineering Inc., Salinas, CA, April 2006.
 - "Archaeological reconnaissance" (LIB070056) prepared by Archaeological Consulting, Salinas, CA, November 8, 2006.
 - (c) Staff conducted a site inspection in January of 2007 to verify that the site is suitable for this use.
 - (d) Materials in Project File PLN060468.
- 3. FINDING

 30-PERCENT SLOPE WAIVER The project as proposes will require the development of a driveway on slopes in excess of 30-percent (30%). Based on the circumstances of the project the county finds (per Section 21.64.230.of Title 21) no feasible alternatives which would allow development to occur on slopes of less than 30%. Additionally the development as proposed would better achieve the goals, policies, and objectives of the Monterey County General Plan and Carmel Valley Master Plan.
 - **EVIDENCE:** (a) Although alternative driveway locations are possible, the proposed driveway design will create the least amount of impact to the site. Based on the grade of Quail Meadows Drive in relation to the project site, there is no location that would completely avoid development on slopes greater than 30-percent.
 - (b) The proposed driveway is not located in a visually sensitive area of the property and is located in an area on the property that will create the least amount of disturbance to the natural resources on site, specifically with regard to tree removal.
 - (c) A Soil engineering report prepared deemed the project suitable provided the recommendations in the report are followed. No significant impacts were

- identified. A standard condition of approval has been implemented to assure compliance with the report (Condition #11).
- (d) Materials in file and applicant's letter of justification for a waiver of the policy prohibiting development on slopes exceeding 30 percent.

(a), and the applicable policies of the Carmel Valley Master Plan [(CVMP)

4. **FINDING:** TREE REMOVAL – The proposed removal of 23 Coast Live Oak is the minimum required under the facts and circumstances of this case; and the removal will not involve a risk of adverse environmental impacts such as: soil erosion; water quality; ecological impacts; noise pollution; air movement; and wildlife habitat. Staff finds the project as proposed in accordance with the applicable policies of the Monterey County General Plan, Zoning Ordinance Title 21 Section 21.64.260

7.2.2.5 (CV)].

- **EVIDENCE:** (a) The property located within the Quall Meadows subdivision lot number 54 on a 3.94-acre parcel. A building envelope was recorded on the property with the restriction that all development of structures is to locate within said envelope. The property contains a scenic and conservation easement on the eastern-most corner of the property to prevent development on slopes as well as protect forest resources. A Forest Management Plan (FMP), prepared by Matt Horowitz, was submitted on November 21, 2006 and was revised to determine the condition of the trees to be removed. This report determined that there is an average tree count of 92.86 trees per acre for a total of about 366 trees on the subject property. The existing oak woodland habitat is estimated to cover over 90% of the (3.94 acres).
 - (b) The applicant has requested as part of developing the proposed residence and driveway to remove 23 protected Oak trees or 6.29-percent of the existing oak woodland located on the property.
 - (c) The project as proposed meets the policies of the Carmel Valley Master Plan (CVMP) 7.2.2.5 (CV) and also recognizing the current requirements under Senate Bill 1334 to minimize impacts and conversion of oak woodlands. The County, in collaboration with the California Department of Fish and Game, recognize that conversion of 10-percent or more of Oak Woodlands can be considered as the threshold for significant impact. In view of this, the project does not reach a level of significant oak woodland removal based on the overall tree count for the subject property.
 - (d) The Zoning Ordinance (Title 21) Section 21.64.260 allows the removal of more than three protected trees with the approval of a Use Permit and relocation or replacement as a consideration of the granting of a tree removal permit. The project Forester determined that it would not be possible to relocate any of the 23 trees proposed for removal. According to the revised Forest Management Plan, transplanting the 23 oak trees with the defects identified in those trees would leave little or no chance of long-term survival. For that reason the forester recommended that the trees be replaced with 15-gallon trees or 24-inch box trees on a one to one ratio. This consistent with the intent of the Carmel Valley Master Plan to replace the removed trees where it is found feasible. Condition 7 encourages forest stability and sustainability through replanting, thereby perpetuating the forested character of the property and immediate vicinity.
 - (e) Condition 6 was incorporated into the project to ensure that the potential for impacts to surrounding trees are avoided. The project Forester assessed the potential for impact to native trees close to the proposed development and

- required tree protection zones and trunk protection measures for the protection of trees during construction.
- (f) A condition has been added that the applicant record a notice stating that a Forest Management Plan has been prepared and any tree removal will be in accordance with the approved plan.
- (g) Forest Management Plan prepared by Forest City Consulting, dated November 21, 2006; revised report dated May 3, 2007 and July 2, 2007. Located in Planning File No. PLN060468.
- 5. **FINDING: CEQA** (**Exempt**): On the basis of the whole record before the Planning Commission there is no substantial evidence to support a fair argument that the proposed project as designed and conditioned may have a significant effect on the environment. Therefore the county finds the project is categorically exempt from environmental review.
 - EVIDENCE: (a) California Environmental Quality Act (CEQA) Guidelines Section 15303 (a) categorically exempts the construction of single-family residences and small accessory structures. The project consists of constructing a new 5,138 square foot, two-story single family dwelling with an attached 1,080 square foot, three-car garage, and a 600-square-foot attached guesthouse, retaining wall, and grading; (approx. 620 cubic yards of cut and 880 cubic yards of fill). Access to the site will include a 237-foot long driveway off Quail Meadows Road. In addition to the driveway, the plans include a guest parking area for one vehicle located at the southwest corner of the residence. Two additional uncovered parking areas located along the driveway southeast of the main entrance were required as conditions of approval by the Fire Protection District to be utilized as a turn-around. Development of the driveway occurs on slopes of 30-percent in the area fronting Quail Meadows Drive between the residence and the road. The project as proposed will require removal of 23 Monterey Coast Live Oak trees ranging in size between 15- and 24-inches.
 - (b) A Forest Management Plan (FMP) was prepared for this project by Forest City Consulting on November 21, 2006; revised report dated May 3, 2007 and July 2, 2007. The objective of the FMP is to minimize erosion, prevent soil loss, preserve natural habitat (including native forest under story and wildlife habitat), prevent forest fires, preserve scenic forest canopy, and preserve landmark trees. The FMP report states that the number of trees removed is the minimum required for the proposed building design. The residence is sited completely within the recorded building envelope. The FMP prepared for the project concludes that, "there are no significant longterm development related impacts anticipated to the native forest resources" based on the applicable policies in Monterey County General Plan, Zoning Ordinance Title 21 Section 21.64.260 (a), applicable policies of the Carmel Valley Master Plan [(CVMP) 7.2.2.5 (CV)], and requirements under Senate Bill 1334. The County, in collaboration with the California Department of Fish and Game, recognize that conversion of 10 percent or more of Oak Woodlands can be considered as the threshold for significant impact. In view of this and the proposed removal of 23 protected trees or 6.29 percent of the oak woodlands on site, staff finds that based on the overall tree count for the subject property does not reach a level of significant tree removal.
 - (c) The Forest Management Plan determined that 6.29- percent of the Oak forest on site would be removed for the development. The development does not exceed the established threshold of 10-percent, therefore the project shall be considered exempt from environmental review.

- (d) No potential adverse environmental effects were identified during staff review of the development application and during a site visit in January of 2007.
- (e) There are no unusual circumstances related to the project or property.
- (f) See preceding and following findings and supporting evidence.
- 6. **FINDING: NO VIOLATIONS -** The subject property is in compliance with all rules and regulations pertaining to zoning uses and any other applicable provisions of the County's zoning ordinance (Title 21). No violations exist on the property. Zoning violation abatement cost, if any, have been paid.
 - **EVIDENCE:** Based on staff's site visit and verification of the Monterey County Planning and Building Inspection Department records, no violations exist on subject property.
- 7. **FINDING: HEALTH & SAFETY -** The establishment, maintenance, and operation of the proposed development will not under the circumstances of the particular case, be detrimental to the health, safety, peace, morals, comfort, and general welfare of persons residing or working in the neighborhood or to the general welfare of the County.
 - **EVIDENCE:** Preceding findings and supporting evidence.
- 8. **FINDING: APPEALABILITY** The decision of the Planning Commission is final and may not be appealed to the Board of Supervisors.
 - **EVIDENCE:** Chapter 21.80 Section 21.80.040 (B) of Title 21, Monterey County Zoning Ordinance.

EXHIBIT D

Monterey County Resource Management Agency Planning Department

Condition Compliance and/or Mitigation Monitoring Reporting Plan

Project: Anthony Jaurique

File No: PLN060468 **APNs:** 157-171-054-000

*Monitoring or Reporting refers to projects with an EIR or adopted Mitigated Negative Declaration per Section 21081.6 of the Public Resources Code.

Permit Cond. Number	Mitig. Number	Impact Addressed, and Responsible Land Use Department	Compliance or Monitoring Actions to be performed. Where applicable, a certified professional is required for action to be accepted.	Responsible Party for Compliance	Timing	Verification of Compliance (name/date)
		PBD029 - SPECIFIC USES ONLY This Combined Development Permit consisting of: 1) Administrative Permit and Design Approval for the construction of a new 5,138 square foot, two story single family dwelling with an attached 1,080 square foot, three-car garage, and a 600-square-foot attached guesthouse, retaining wall; 287-foot long driveway; and grading; (approx. 620 cubic yards of cut and 880 cubic yards of fill) located in a "S" zoning district; 2) Use Permit to allow development on slopes greater than 30-percent,; and 3) Use Permit for the removal of 23 protected trees (Coast live oak). The property is located at 5435 Quail Meadows Drive (Assessor's Parcel Number 157-171-054-0000) west of Carmel Valley Road in Carmel Valley Master Plan Area. This permit was approved in accordance with County ordinances and land use regulations subject to the following terms and conditions. Neither the uses nor the construction allowed by this permit shall commence unless and until all of the conditions of this permit are met to the satisfaction of the Director of Planning and Building Inspection. Any use or construction not in substantial conformance with the terms and conditions of this permit is a violation of County regulations and may result in modification or revocation of this permit and subsequent legal action. No use or construction other than that specified by this permit is allowed unless the appropriate authorities approve additional permits. [Resource Management Agency (RMA) - Planning Department]	Adhere to conditions and uses specified in the permit.	Owner/ Applicant	Ongoing unless other-wise stated	

Permit Cond. Number	Mitig. Number	Impact Addressed, and Responsible Land Use Department	Compliance or Monitoring Actions to be performed. Where applicable, a certified professional is required for action to be accepted.	Responsible Party for Compliance	Timing	Verification of Compliance (name/date)
		PBD016 - INDEMNIFICATION AGREEMENT The property owner agrees as a condition and in consideration of the approval of this discretionary development permit that it will, pursuant to agreement and/or statutory provisions as applicable, including but not limited to Government Code Section 66474.9, defend, indemnify and hold harmless the County of Monterey or its agents, officers and employees from any claim, action or proceeding against the County or its agents, officers or employees to attack, set aside, void or annul this approval, which action is brought within the time period provided for under law, including but not limited to, Government Code Section 66499.37, as applicable. The property owner will reimburse the county for any court costs and attorney's fees which the County may be required by a court to pay as a result of such action. County may, at its sole discretion, participate in the defense of such action; but such participate in the defense of such action; but such participation shall not relieve applicant of his obligations under this condition. An agreement to this effect shall be recorded upon demand of County Counsel or concurrent with the issuance of building permits, use of the property, filing of the final map, whichever occurs first and as applicable. The County shall promptly notify the property owner of any such claim, action, or proceeding and the County shall cooperate fully in the defense thereof. If the County fails to promptly notify the property owner of any such claim, action, or proceeding or fails to cooperate fully in the defense thereof, the property owner shall not thereafter be responsible to defend, indemnify, or hold the county harmless. (RMA-Planning Department)	Proof of recordation of the Indemnification Agreement, as outlined, shall be submitted to PBI.	Owner/ Applicant	Upon demand of County Counsel or concurrent with the issuance of building permits, use of the property, filing of the final map, which-ever occurs first and as applicable	

Permit Cond. Number	Mitig. Number	Impact Addressed, and Responsible Land Use Department	Compliance or Monitoring Actions to be performed. Where applicable, a certified professional is required for action to be accepted.	Responsible Party for Compliance	Timing	Verification of Compliance (name/date)
3		PD002 - NOTICE-PERMIT APPROVAL The applicant shall record a notice, which states: "A permit (Resolution 060648) was approved by the Planning Commission for Assessor's Parcel Number (157-171-054- 000) on August 8, 2007. The permit was granted subject to 21 conditions of approval, which run with the land. A copy of the permit is on file with the Monterey County RMA - Planning Department." Proof of recordation of this notice shall be furnished to the Director of the RMA - Planning Department prior to issuance of building permits or commencement of the use. (RMA - Planning Department)	Proof of recordation of this notice shall be furnished to the RMA - Planning Department.	Owner/ Applicant	Prior to the issuance of grading and building permits or commence ment of use.	
4		PD014(B) – LIGHTING – EXTERIOR LIGHTING PLAN (VISUAL SENSITIVITY DISTRICT/ RIDGELINE DEVELOPMENT) All exterior lighting shall be unobtrusive, down-lit, harmonious with the local area, and constructed or located so that only the intended area is illuminated and off-site glare is fully controlled. Exterior lights shall have recessed lighting elements. Exterior light sources that would be directly visible from when viewed from a common public viewing area, as defined in Section 21.06.195, are prohibited. The applicant shall submit 3 copies of an exterior lighting plan which shall indicate the location, type, and wattage of all light fixtures and include catalog sheets for each fixture. The lighting shall comply with the requirements of the California Energy Code set forth in California Code of Regulations, Title 24, Part 6. The exterior lighting plan shall be subject to	Submit three copies of the lighting plans to the RMA - Planning Department for review and approval. Approved lighting plans shall be incorporated into final building plans. The lighting shall be installed and maintained in accordance with the approved plan.	Owner/ Applicant Architect	Prior to the issuance of building permits. Prior to Occupancy/ Ongoing	
	approval by the Director of the RMA - Planning Department, prior to the issuance of building permits. (RMA – Planning Department)					

Permit Cond. Number	Mitig. Number	Impact Addressed, and Responsible Land Use Department	Compliance or Monitoring Actions to be performed. Where applicable, a certified professional is required for action to be accepted.	Responsible Party for Compliance	Timing	Verification of Compliance (name/date)
5		PD012(A) - LANDSCAPE PLAN AND MAINTENANCE (SINGLE FAMILY DWELLING ONLY) The site shall be landscaped. At least three (3) weeks prior to occupancy, three (3) copies of a landscaping plan shall be submitted to the Director of the RMA - Planning Department. A landscape plan review fee is required for this project. Fees shall be paid at the time of landscape plan submittal. The landscaping plan shall be in sufficient detail to identify the location, species, and size of the proposed landscaping materials and shall include an irrigation plan. The plan shall be accompanied by a nursery or contractor's estimate of the cost of installation of the plan. Before occupancy, landscaping shall be either installed or a certificate of deposit or other form of surety made payable to Monterey County for that cost estimate shall be submitted to the Monterey County RMA - Planning Department. All landscaped areas and fences shall be continuously maintained by the applicant; all plant material shall be continuously maintained in a litter-free, weed-free, healthy, growing condition. (RMA - Planning Department)	Submit landscape plans and contractor's estimate to the RMA - Planning Department for review and approval. Also See Condition 7 All landscaped areas and fences shall be continuously maintained by the applicant; all plant material shall be continuously maintained in a litter-free, weed-free, healthy, growing condition.	Owner/ Applicant Licensed Landscape Contractor/ Licensed Landscape Architect	At least three (3) weeks prior to final inspection or occupancy Ongoing	

Permit Cond. Number	Mitig. Number	Impact Addressed, and Responsible Land Use Department	Compliance or Monitoring Actions to be performed. Where applicable, a certified professional is required for action to be accepted.	Responsible Party for Compliance	Timing	Verification of Compliance (name/date)
6		PD011 – TREE AND ROOT PROTECTION Trees which are located close to the construction site(s) shall be protected from inadvertent damage from construction equipment by fencing off the canopy driplines and/or critical root zones (whichever is greater) with protective materials, wrapping trunks with protective materials, avoiding fill of any type against the base of the trunks and avoiding an increase in soil depth at the feeding zone or drip-line of the retained trees. Said protection, approved by a certified arborist, shall be demonstrated prior to issuance of building permits subject to the approval of the RMA – Director of Planning. If there is any potential for damage, all work must stop in the area and a report, with mitigation measures, shall be submitted by a certified arborist. Should any additional trees not included in this permit be harmed, during grading or construction activities, in such a way where removal is required, the owner/applicant shall obtain required permits.(RMA - Planning Department)	Submit evidence of tree protection to the RMA - Planning Department for review and approval. Submit on-going evidence that tree protection measures are in place through out grading and construction phases. If damage is possible, submit an interim report prepared by a certified arborist. Also See Condition 7 Submit photos of the trees on the property to the RMA – Planning Department after construction to document that tree protection has been successful or if follow-up remediation or additional permits are required.	Owner/ Applicant Certified Forester/ Arborist	Prior to the issuance of grading and/or building permits During Construction Prior to final inspection	

Permit Cond. Number	Mitig. Number	Impact Addressed, and Responsible Land Use Department	Compliance or Monitoring Actions to be performed. Where applicable, a certified professional is required for action to be accepted.	Responsible Party for Compliance	Timing	Verification of Compliance (name/date)
7	The project Forester shall coordinate with the Landscape Architect/Contractor to create a comprehensive Landscape Plan that includes replacement trees with any proposed other planting to assure there is no conflict. Trees scheduled for removal shall be replaced at a minimum 1:1 ratio with tees 18-incehs dbh or greater to be replaced with a minimum 24- inch box size tree and trees that are less than 18-inches dbh to be replaced with minimum 15-gallon sized trees. Written and photographic verification from the Forester is required to verify planting has been done in accordance with the Forest Management Plan (Lib # 070057). The plan shall be accompanied by a Monitoring Program that includes monitoring for a minimum of three years to assure 100% success for the replacement trees. The report shall provide evidence to indicate the health and condition of replacement	Submit a Tree Replacement Plan with a monitoring program prepared by a certified Forester Also See Conditions 5 and 10	Owner/ Applicant Certified Forester/ Arborist	Prior to issuance of permits		
		Submit written and photographic verification that the replacement tree trees are installed accordance with the Forest Management Plan shall be furnished to the RMA - Planning Department.		Prior to Occupancy		
		evidence to indicate the health and condition of replacement trees as well as other native trees within proximity of the construction area not scheduled for removal. In the event any initial plantings fails or other native trees fail during or within one year of construction, new trees shall be planted with a new 3-year monitoring period to assure 100% success of all replacement trees. All replacement trees shale b installed prior to occupancy to the satisfaction of the Monterey County RMA - Planning Department. (RMA – Planning Department)	Submit monitoring reports prepared by a certified Forester annually for 3 years. Said report shall be subject to review and approval of the RMA - Planning Director who shall have the ability to require additional mitigation as deemed necessary to assure 100% success and to mitigate for any trees impacted that were not considered as part of the original removal. Also See Condition 6		Annually for 3 years following completion of planting.	

Permit Cond. Number	Mitig. Number	Impact Addressed, and Responsible Land Use Department	Compliance or Monitoring Actions to be performed. Where applicable, a certified professional is required for action to be accepted.	Responsible Party for Compliance	Timing	Verification of Compliance (name/date)
8		PD010 - EROSION CONTROL PLAN AND SCHEDULE The approved development shall incorporate the recommendations of the Erosion Control Plan as reviewed by the Director of RMA – Planning and Director of Building Services. All cut and/or fill slopes exposed during the course of construction be covered, seeded, or otherwise treated to control erosion during the course of construction, subject to the approval of the Director of RMA - Planning and Director of RMA - Building Services. The improvement and grading plans shall include an implementation schedule of measures for the prevention and control of erosion, siltation and dust during and immediately following construction and until erosion control planting becomes established. This program shall be approved by the Director of RMA - Planning and Director of RMA - Building Services. (RMA - Planning Department and RMA - Building Services Department)	Evidence of compliance with the Erosion Control Plan shall be submitted to the RMA - Planning Department and the RMA - Building Services Department prior to issuance of building and grading permits. Also See Condition 11 Comply with the recommendations of the Erosion Control Plan during the course of construction until project completion as approved by the Director of RMA - Planning and Director of RMA - Building Services. Evidence of compliance with the Implementation Schedule shall be submitted to the RMA - Planning Department and the RMA - Building Services Department	Owner/ Applicant Engineer/ Architect	Prior to the issuance of grading and building permits During construction Prior to final inspection	

Permit Cond. Number	Mitig. Number	Impact Addressed, and Responsible Land Use Department	Compliance or Monitoring Actions to be performed. Where applicable, a certified professional is required for action to be accepted.	Responsible Party for Compliance	Timing	Verification of Compliance (name/date)
9		PDSP002 – HEIGHT VERIFICATION (NON STANDARD) The applicant shall have a benchmark placed upon the property and identify the benchmark on the building plans. The benchmark shall remain visible onsite until final building inspection. The applicant shall provide evidence	1) The applicant shall have a benchmark placed upon the property and identify the benchmark on the building plans. The benchmark shall remain visible onsite until final building inspection	Owner/ Applicant Engineer/ Surveyor	Prior to the issuance of grading or building permits	
	approval, that the height of the structure(s) from the benchmark is consistent with what was approved for the Quail Meadows subdivision which recorded a height limit on lot 54 of 25 feet. (RMA – Planning Department and Building Services Department)	2) The applicant shall provide evidence from a licensed civil engineer or surveyor, to the Director of the RMA- Building Services Department for review and approval, that the height of the structure(s) from the benchmark is consistent with what was approved on the building permit.		Prior to the final inspection		
10		Prior to issuance of building or grading permits, a notice shall be recorded with the Monterey County Recorder which states: "A(n) Forest Management Plan has been prepared for this parcel by Forest City Consulting, dated November 21, 2006 and is on record in the Monterey County RMA - Planning Department, Library No. 070057. All development shall be in accordance with this report." (RMA – Planning Department)	Proof of recordation of this notice shall be furnished to the RMA - Planning Department. Also See Condition 7	Owner/ Applicant	Prior to the issuance of grading and building permits.	
11		PD016 – NOTICE OF REPORT Prior to issuance of building or grading permits, a notice shall be recorded with the Monterey County Recorder which states: "A(n) Soils Engineering Investigation report has been prepared for this parcel by lancet Engineering Inc, dated April 2006 and is on record in the Monterey County RMA - Planning Department, Library No. 070055. All development shall be in accordance with this report." (RMA – Planning Department)	Proof of recordation of this notice shall be furnished to the RMA - Planning Department. Also See Condition 8	Owner/ Applicant	Prior to the issuance of grading and building permits.	

Permit Cond. Number	Mitig. Number	Impact Addressed, and Responsible Land Use Department	Compliance or Monitoring Actions to be performed. Where applicable, a certified professional is required for action to be accepted.	Responsible Party for Compliance	Timing	Verification of Compliance (name/date)
12		PD016 – NOTICE OF REPORT Prior to issuance of building or grading permits, a notice shall be recorded with the Monterey County Recorder which states: "A(n) Archaeological Reconnaissance report has been prepared for this parcel by Archaeological Consultants, dated November 8, 2006 and is on record in the Monterey County RMA - Planning Department, Library No. 070056. All development shall be in accordance with this report." (RMA – Planning Department)	Proof of recordation of this notice shall be furnished to the RMA - Planning Department.	Owner/ Applicant	Prior to the issuance of grading and building permits.	
13		PWSP001 – TRAFFIC FEE (NON STANDARD) Prior to issuance of the building permit applicant shall contribute \$15,000 to the county for future improvements to Carmel Valley Road.(Public Works)	Compliance to be verified by building department before issuance of building permits.	Owner/ Applicant	Prior to issuance of any building permits	
14		WR43 - WATER AVAILABILITY CERTIFICATION The applicant shall obtain from the Monterey County Water Resources Agency, proof of water availability on the property, in the form of an approved Monterey Peninsula Water Management District Water Release Form. (Water Resources Agency)	Submit the Water Release Form to the Water Resources Agency for review and approval.	Owner/ Applicant	Prior to issuance of any building permits	

Permit Cond. Number	Mitig. Number	Impact Addressed, and Responsible Land Use Department	Compliance or Monitoring Actions to be performed. Where applicable, a certified professional is required for action to be accepted.	Responsible Party for Compliance	Timing	Verification of Compliance (name/date)
15		 WR40 - WATER CONSERVATION MEASURES The applicant shall comply with Ordinance No. 3932, or as subsequently amended, of the Monterey County Water Resources Agency pertaining to mandatory water conservation regulations. The regulations for new construction require, but are not limited to: 1. All toilets shall be ultra-low flush toilets with a maximum tank size or flush capacity of 1.6 gallons, all shower heads shall have a maximum flow capacity of 2.5 gallons per minute, and all hot water faucets that have more than ten feet of pipe between the faucet and the hot water heater serving such faucet shall be equipped with a hot water recirculation system. 2. Landscape plans shall apply xeriscape principles, including such techniques and materials as native or low water use plants and low precipitation sprinkler heads, bubblers, drip irrigation systems and timing devices. (Water Resources Agency) 	Compliance to be verified by building inspector at final inspection.	Owner/ Applicant	Prior to final building inspection / occupancy	
16		WRSP001 - STORMWATER CONTROL (NON-STANDARD WORDING) The applicant shall provide the Water Resources Agency a drainage plan prepared by a registered civil engineer or architect addressing on-site and off-site impacts. Stormwater runoff from impervious surfaces shall be dispersed at multiple points, over the least steep available slopes, with erosion control at outlets. Drainage improvements shall be constructed in accordance with plans approved by the Water Resources Agency. (Water Resources Agency)	Submit 3 copies of the drainage plan to the Water Resources Agency for review and approval.	Owner/ Applicant	Prior to issuance of any grading or building permits	

Permit Cond. Number	Mitig. Number	Impact Addressed, and Responsible Land Use Department	Compliance or Monitoring Actions to be performed. Where applicable, a certified professional is required for action to be accepted.	Responsible Party for Compliance	Timing	Verification of Compliance (name/date)
17	Driveways shall not be less than 12 feet wide unobstructed, with an unobstructed vertical clearance of not less than 15 feet. The grade for all driveways shall not exceed 15 percent. Where the grade exceeds 8 percent, a minimum structural roadway surface of 0.17 feet of asphaltic concrete on 0.34 feet of aggregate base shall be required. The driveway surface shall be capable of supporting the imposed load of fire apparatus (22 tons), and be accessible by conventional-drive vehicles, including sedans. For driveways with turns 90 degrees and less, the minimum horizontal inside radius of curvature shall be 25 feet. For driveways with turns greater than 90 degrees, the minimum horizontal inside radius curvature shall be 28 feet. For all driveway turns, an additional surface of 4 feet shall be added. All driveways exceeding 150 feet in length, but less than 800 feet in length, shall provide a turnout near the midpoint of the driveway.	Applicant shall incorporate specification into design and enumerate as "Fire Dept. Notes" on plans. Applicant shall schedule fire dept. clearance inspection	Applicant or owner Applicant or owner	Prior to issuance of grading and/or building permit. Prior to final building		
				inspection.		

Permit Cond. Number	Mitig. Number	Impact Addressed, and Responsible Land Use Department	Compliance or Monitoring Actions to be performed. Where applicable, a certified professional is required for action to be accepted.	Responsible Party for Compliance	Timing	Verification of Compliance (name/date)
18		FIRE008 - GATES All gates providing access from a road to a driveway shall be located at least 30 feet from the roadway and shall open to allow a vehicle to stop without obstructing traffic on the road. Gate entrances shall be at least the width of the traffic lane but in no case less than 12 feet wide. Where a one-way road with a single traffic lane provides access to a gated entrance, a 40-foot turning radius shall be used. Where gates are to be locked, the installation of a key box or other acceptable means for immediate access by emergency equipment may be required. (Carmel Highlands Fire Protection District)	Applicant shall incorporate specification into design and enumerate as "Fire Dept. Notes" on plans.	Applicant or owner	Prior to issuance of grading and/or building permit.	
			Applicant shall schedule fire dept. clearance inspection	Applicant or owner	Prior to final building inspection.	
19		FIRE009 - BRIDGES All new and reconstructed bridges shall be at least the width of the roadbed and berms, but in no case less than 12 feet wide. Bridge width on all roads exceeding tertiary standards shall not be less than the width of the two lanes with berms. All bridges shall be designed for HS15-44 loading and have guardrails. Appropriate signage, including but not limited to, weight ratings or vertical clearance limitations, and one-way road or single-lane road conditions, shall be provided at both entrances to any bridge. One-lane bridges may be permitted if there is unobstructed visibility across the entire bridge, and turnouts are provided at both bridge ends. The fire authority may impose more stringent requirements for bridges. (Carmel Highlands Fire Protection District)	Applicant shall incorporate specification into design and enumerate as "Fire Dept. Notes" on plans.	Applicant or owner	Prior to issuance of grading and/or building permit.	

Permit Cond. Number	Mitig. Number	Impact Addressed, and Responsible Land Use Department	Compliance or Monitoring Actions to be performed. Where applicable, a certified professional is required for action to be accepted.	Responsible Party for Compliance	Timing	Verification of Compliance (name/date)
20		FIRE011 - ADDRESSES FOR BUILDINGS All buildings shall be issued an address in accordance with Monterey County Ordinance No. 1241. Each occupancy, except accessory buildings, shall have its own permanently posted address. When multiple occupancies exist within a single building, each individual occupancy shall be separately identified by its own address. Letters, numbers, and symbols for addresses shall be a minimum of 4-inch height, 1/2-inch stroke, contrasting with the background color of the sign, and shall be Arabic. The sign and numbers shall be reflective and made of a noncombustible material. Address signs shall be placed at each driveway entrance and at each driveway split. Address signs shall be and visible from both directions of travel along the road. In all cases, the address shall be posted at the beginning of construction and shall be maintained thereafter. Address signs along one-way roads shall be visible from both directions of travel. Where multiple addresses are required at a single driveway, they shall be mounted on a single sign. Where a roadway provides access solely to a single commercial occupancy, the address sign shall be placed at the nearest road intersection providing access to that site. Permanent address numbers shall be posted prior to requesting final clearance. Responsible Land Use Department: (Carmel Highlands Fire Protection District)	Applicant shall incorporate specification into design and enumerate as "Fire Dept. Notes" on plans.	Applicant or owner	Prior to issuance of building permit.	

Permit Cond. Number	Mitig. Number	Impact Addressed, and Responsible Land Use Department	Compliance or Monitoring Actions to be performed. Where applicable, a certified professional is required for action to be accepted.	Responsible Party for Compliance	Timing	Verification of Compliance (name/date)
21	FIRE021 - FIRE PROTECTION EQUIPMENT & SYSTEMS - FIRE SPRINKLER SYSTEM (STANDARD) The building(s) and attached garage(s) shall be fully protected with automatic fire sprinkler system(s). Installation shall be in accordance with the applicable NFPA standard. A minimum of four (4) sets of plans for	Applicant shall enumerate as "Fire Dept. Notes" on plans.	Applicant or owner	Prior to issuance of building permit.		
		fire sprinkler systems must be submitted by a California licensed C-16 contractor and approved prior to installation. This requirement is not intended to delay issuance of a building permit. A rough sprinkler inspection must be	Applicant shall schedule fire dept. rough sprinkler inspection	Applicant or owner	Prior to framing inspection	
		scheduled by the installing contractor and completed prior to requesting a framing inspection. (Carmel Highlands Fire Protection District)	Applicant shall schedule fire dept. final sprinkler inspection	Applicant or owner	Prior to final building inspection	

END OF CONDITIONS